OXFORD JOURNAL OF LEGAL STUDIES

VOLUME 12

Published on behalf of The Faculty of Law,
University of Oxford

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
1992

General Editor: P. M. North

Editorial Committee: J. C. McCrudden, P. N. Mirfield,
D. D. Prentice, J. Hackney, S. Gardner, A. Briggs

Oxford University Press, Walton Street, Oxford OX2 6DP
Oxford New York Toronto
Delhi Bombay Calcutta Madras Karachi
Petaling Jaya Singapore Hong Kong Tokyo
Nairobi Dar es Salaam Cape Town
Melbourne Auckland

and associate companies in
Beirut Berlin Ibadan Nicosia

© *Oxford University Press 1992*
except where otherwise indicated

CONTENTS

ARTICLES

BARNUM, DAVID G., SULLIVAN, JOHN L., and SUNKIN, MAURICE, Constitutional and Cultural Underpinnings of Political Freedom in Britain and the United States 362
BRIDGE, MICHAEL, The Quistclose Trust in a World of Secured Transactions 333
BOYRON, SOPHIE, Proportionality in English Administrative Law: A Faulty Translation? 237
CRAIG, P. P., Once Upon a Time in the West: Direct Effect and the Federalization of EEC Law 453
FEINBERG, JOEL, In Defence of Moral Rights 149
FERGUSON, PAMELA R., Liability for Pharmaceutical Products: A Critique of the 'Learned Intermediary' Rule 59
FREDMAN, SANDRA, The New Rights: Labour Law and Idealogy in the Thatcher Years 24
GARDNER, SIMON, Trashing with Trollope: A Deconstruction of the Postal Rules in Contract 170
GOODRICH, PETER, Critical Legal Studies in England: Prospective Histories 195
JABBARI, DAVID, From Criticism to Construction in Modern Critical Legal Theory 507
JACONELLI, JOSEPH, Solomonic Justice and the Common Law 480
LEE, ROBERT G., Rent Control—The Economic Impact of Social Legislation 543
NORRIE, ALAN, Subjectivism, Objectivism and the Limits of Criminal Recklessness 45
PAULSON, STANLEY L., The Neo-Kantian Dimension of Kelsen's Pure Theory of Law 311
SCANLON, T. M., The Aims and Authority of Moral Theory 1
SULLIVAN, G. R., Intent, Subjective Recklessness and Culpability 380

REVIEW ARTICLES

CRAIG, P. P., What Should Public Lawyers Do? A Reply 564
DOCKSEY, CHRIS and WILLIAMS, KAREN, In Search of 1992—A Stroll Through the Law Books 99
FLEMING, JOHN G., Once More—Economic Loss 558
O'LEARY, BRENDAN, What Should Public Lawyers Do? 404
PAULSON, STANLEY, L., Kelsen's Legal Theory: The Final Round 265
ROBERTSON, BERNARD and VIGNAUX, G. A., Expert Evidence: Law, Practice and Probability 392
VON HIRSCH, ANDREW and ASHWORTH, ANDREW, Not Just Deserts: A Response to Braithwaite and Pettit 83
YOUDAN, T. G., Writing on the Law of Trusts 275

SHORTER ARTICLES AND COMMENTS

ANTOINE, R. M. B., International Law and the Right to Legal Representation in Capital Offence Cases—A Comparative Approach 284
CUMBERBATCH, JEFF, In Freedom's Cause: The Contract to Negotiate 586
HAYES, JOHN A., After Murphy: Building on the Consumer Protection Principle 112
HILL, JONATHAN, International Corporations in the English Courts 135
HORDER, JEREMY, The Duel and the English Law of Homicide 419
MULLANY, NICHOLAS J., Common Sense Causation—An Australian View 431
SIMESTER, A. P., Mistakes in Defence 295
STONE, RICHARD, Reckless Assaults after *Savage* and *Parmenter* 578
TEFF, HARVEY, Liability for Psychiatric Illness after Hillsborough 440
TOWNSHEND-SMITH, RICHARD, American Civil Rights in Retreat 129

LEGISLATION

[Entries refer to statutes receiving substantial discussion or criticism in the volume.]

UNITED KINGDOM

Companies Act 1985 336, 341, 344, 351, 355
Companies Act 1989 341, 344
Consumer Protection Act 1987
s 3(2)(a) 63
s 4(1)(e) 63
Conveyancing Act 1881
s 67(4) 191
Criminal Attempts Act 1981
s 1 384, 385
Defective Premises Act 1972 122
s 1 125–6
s 2 126
Diplomatic Privileges (Extension) Act 1944 140
Employment Act 1982 26 et seq
Employment Act 1988 27 et seq
s 13 33
Employment Act 1990 26 et seq
Highways Act 1959 518
Housing Act 1988 543 et seq
s 121 548–9
Insolvency Act 1986 340
International Organisations Act 1968 138 et seq
s 1 138–9, 140
s 4 139, 140
Joint Stock Companies Act 1856 186
Latent Damage Act 1986 125–6
Law of Property Act 1925
s 196(4) 191, 192
Law Reform (Contributory Negligence) Act 1945 482, 485–6, 488
Limited Liability Act 1855 186
Medicines Act 1968 62
Offences Against the Person Act 1981 578 et seq
s 18 584, 585
s 20 579 et seq
s 47 579 et seq
Race Relations Act 1976
s (1)(b) 129–30
Sale of Goods Act 1979
s 55(4) 488
Sex Discrimination Act 1975
s 1(1)(b) 129–30
Telegraph Act 1869
s 4 190
Trade Union Act 1984 27, 32
Trade Union Act 1986 27
Treaty of Rome
Art 30 462
36 462
48 469 et seq
52 463, 469 et seq
57 467
95 461
97 461
119 463 et seq
169 454 et seq
170 454
171 455, 466

177 457 et seq
189 470–1, 473
224 461
226 461
Unfair Contract Terms Act 1977
s 2(2) 118
Vaccine Damage Payments Act 1970 76–7, 78
Wages Act 1986 38

OTHER COUNTRIES

Civil Rights Act 1964 (USA)
Title VII 129
Second Restatement of Torts 1965 (USA)
s 402A 64 et seq
Uniform Commercial Code (USA)
Article 9 335 et seq
Wrongs Act 1936 (Aus) 432

CASES

[Entries refer to cases receiving substantial discussion or criticism in this volume.]

Adams *v* Lindsell (1818) 170 et seq
Airey *v* Ireland (1979–80) (EC) 292
Albert *v* Lavin (1982) 301, 307
Alcock *v* Chief Constable of South Yorkshire Police (1991) 440 et seq
Amsterdam Bulb *v* Produktschap voor Siergewassen (1977) (EC) 471
Anns *v* Merton London Borough Council (1978) 112 et seq, 440 et seq
Arab Monetary Fund *v* Hashim (No 3) (1991) 135 et seq
Artico *v* Italy (1981) (Eur) 291–2
Associated Provincial Picture Houses Ltd *v* Wednesbury Corporation (1947) 237 et seq
Attorney-General *v* Jonathan Cape Ltd (1976) 25
Bacardi *v* Holzman (1981) (USA) 76
Backhouse *v* Lambeth London Borough Council (1972) 252
Barclays Bank Ltd *v* Quistclose Investments Ltd (1970) 333–61
Barrett (1981) 301
Beaugé (1964) (Fr) 251–2
Beckford *v* R (1988) 295, 299 et seq
Beecham *v* Hughes (1988) 449
Benjamin (1933) (Fr) 244
Beshada *v* Johns-Manville Products Corp (1982) (USA) 64–5
British and American Telegraph Co *v* Colson (1871) 173, 185
Brown *v* Superior Court (1988) (USA) 65
Buckner *v* Allergan Pharmaceuticals Inc (1981) (USA) 66
Bumper Development Corporation *v* Commissioner of Police for the Metropolis (1991) 136
Burfitt *v* Kille (1939) 67–8
Bushell *v* Secretary of State for the Environment (1980) 518, 519–20
Byrne & Co *v* Leon Van Tienhoven & Co (1880) 176– 178, 189 et seq
Caldwell *v* Caldwell (1982) 49
Campbell and Fell *v* UK (1985) (EC) 292
Canal, Robin et Godot (1962) (Fr) 247–8
Canterbury *v* Spence (1972) (USA) 70
Carreras Rothmans Ltd *v* Freeman Mathews Treasure Ltd (1985) 358–60
Cheval (1978) (Fr) 249, 256
City of Kamloops *v* Nielsen (1984) (Can) 119
Council of Civil Service Unions *v* Minister for the Civil Service (1984) (GCHQ) 237, 238, 264
Council of Civil Service *v* Minister for the Civil Service, the GCHQ Case (1985) 237, 238, 264
Courtney and Fairburn Ltd *v* Tolaini Brothers (Hotels) Ltd (1975) 586–7

Dame Ebri et Union Syndicale de Défense des propriétaires du Massif de la Clape (1975) (Fr) 242
Dadson (1850) 302–4
Darcey *v* Markham (1616) 427
Davis *v* Wyeth Laboratories (1968) (USA) 72–3, 76
Defrenne *v* Sabena (1967) (EC) 467–9
Department of the Environment *v* Thomas Bates & Sons (1989) 115
Devi *v* West Midlands Health Authority (1980) 69
Devilez *v* Boots Pure Drug Co (1962) 60
DPP *v* K (1990) 578–9
DPP *v* Morgan (1976) 295, 297 et seq
Dunlop *v* Higgins (1848) 172, 173, 184
Duport Steels Ltd *v* Sirs (1980) 257
Dutton *v* Bognor Regis United Building Co Ltd (1972) 113 et seq
Dwight *v* Roderick and Jackson and Cross Chemists Banbury Ltd (1982) 67
Elliot *v* C (1983) 49
Ex p Church of Scientology of California (1978) 514–15
Fabrèque (1909) (Fr) 252
Farley *v* Turner (1857) 350
Faulkner (1877) 49–50
Feldman *v* Lederle Laboratories (1984) (USA) 65
George Mitchell (Chester Hall) Ltd *v* Finney Lock Seeds Ltd (1983) 488
Franz Grad *v* Finanzamt Traunstein (1971) (EC) 473–5
Givens *v* Lederle (1974) 73–4
Gold *v* Haringey Health Authority (1988) 77–8
Greater Nottingham Co-operative Society Ltd *v* Cementation Piling and Foundations Ltd (1989) 117, 124, 127
Griggs *v* Duke Power Company (1971) (USA) 129
Griswold *v* Connecticut (1965) (USA) 150
Group d'Information et de Soutien des Travailleurs Immigrés et autres (GISTI) (1978) (Fr) 253–4
Harris' Case (1872) 175–6, 187
Hedley Byrne & Co Ltd *v* Heller & Partners Ltd (1964) 113, 117–18, 121 et seq
Henthorn *v* Fraser (1892) 175, 176–7, 191
Hevican *v* Ruane (1991) 442, 444, 451
Hollingworth *v* Tooke (1795) 349–50
Holmes *v* Ashford (1950) 61–2, 78
Holwell Securities Ltd *v* Hughes (1974) 192
Household Fire and Carriage Accident Insurance Co *v* Grant (1879) 174–5, 177
Hyam *v* Director of Public Prosecutions (1975) 390
Ingram *v* Little (1961) 493 et seq
Investors in Industry Commercial Property Ltd *v* South Bedfordshire District Council (1986) 120
Jenkins *v* Kingsgate (Clothing Productions) Ltd (1981) 250–1
Junior Books *v* Veitchi Co Ltd (1983) 112, 116 et seq, 561–2
Kaiser *v* Suburban Transportation System (1965) (USA) 67, 68
Klink *v* G D Searle & Co (1980) (USA) 67
Kruse *v* Johnson (1898) 252–3
Leahy *v* Attorney General for New South Wales (1959) 277, 293
Leonosio *v* Italian Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (1973) (EC) 470
Loving *v* Virginia (1967) (USA) 150
Lukaszewicz *v* Ortho Pharmaceuticals (1981) (USA) 74
MacDonald *v* Ortho Pharmaceutical Corporation (1985) (USA) 75–6, 80
McCue *v* Norwich Pharmacy Co (1972) (USA) 66
McGhee *v* National Coal Board (1973) 437 et seq
McKee *v* Moore (1982) (USA) 76
McLoughlin *v* O'Brian (1983) 440 et seq
Manolakos *v* Gohmann (1990) (Can) 120
March *v* E & M H Stramare Pty Ltd (1991) 431 et seq
Marleasing SA *v* La Commercial International De Aliméntation SA (1990) (EC) 477–8

Marshall *v* Southampton & South West Hampshire Area Health Authority (Teaching) (1986) (EC) 476–7, 478
Metropolitan Properties *v* Lannon (1969) 514
Miller *v* Denovan (1960) 48, 50
Ministre de l'équipement et du logement *c* Fédération de défense des personnes concernées par le project actuellement dénommé 'Ville Nouvelle Est' (1971) (Fr) 244–5
Molkerei–Zentrale Westfalen/Lippe GmbH (1968) (EC) 461–3
Murphy *v* Brentwood District Council (1990) 112–28
Neste Oy *v* Lloyd's Bank Plc (1983) 359–60
Nottinghamshire County Council *v* Secretary of State for the Environment (1986) 257
Pakelli *v* Germany (1984) (EC) 292
Peabody Donation Fund (Governors) *v* Sir Lindsay Parkinson & Co Ltd (1985) 120, 124
Pinto *v* Trinidad and Tobago (1990) (UN) 289, 290
Pratt and Morgan *v* Jamaica (1989) (UN) 289, 293
R *v* Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council, ex p Hook (1976) 254–6
R *v* Brent Borough Council, ex p Assegai (1987) 253
R *v* Caldwell (1982) 301–2, 309, 578, 582, 584
R *v* Chedzey (1987) 396 et seq
R *v* Cunningham (1957) 578, 582
R *v* Fernandez (1980) 253
R *v* Harding (1936) 398
R *v* Hillingdon LBC, ex p Royco Ltd (1974) 251
R *v* Khan (1990) 380 et seq
R *v* Mowatt (1967) 580, 584
R *v* Nash (1991) 585
R *v* Roberts (1972) 581–2
R *v* Savage, R *v* Parmenter (1991) 578 et seq
R *v* Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex p Brind (1991) 237, 258, 260
R *v* Spratt (1991) 579
R *v* Tolson (1889) 305
R *v* Williams (1983) 295, 299 et seq
R *v* Wilson (Clarence) (1983) 581
Ratti (1979) (EC) 475
Ravenscroft *v* Rederiaktiebolaget Transatlantic (1991) 442, 444, 451
Rayner (JH) (Mincing Lane) Ltd *v* Department of Trade and Industry (1990) 135 et seq
Re Chelsea Cloisters Ltd (1981) 356–7
Re Connolly Brothers Ltd (No 2) (1912) 394
Re Curtain Dream Plc (1990) 335
Re EVTR (1987) 353–4
Re J S (A Minor) (1981) 399 et seq
Re Kayford (1975) 355–6
Re Multi-Guarantee Ltd (1987) 357, 359
Re Nanwa Gold Mines Ltd (1955) 351 et seq
Re National Savings Bank Association, Hebb's Case (1867) 172, 175
Reckitt and Coleman *v* Borden Inc (No 2) (1987) 401
Reid *v* Jamaica (1990) (UN) 284, 290–1
Reyes *v* Wyeth Laboratories (1974) 66–7, 73, 76
Reyners *v* Belgian State (1974) (EC) 463 et seq
Rhodes *v* Canadian National Railway (1990) (Can) 450–1
Richardson *v* West Lindsey District Council (1990) 120–1
Robinson *v* Jamaica (1989) (UN) 288
Robinson *v* R (1985) 286–7
Schloendorff *v* Society of New York Hospitals (1914) (USA) 69–70
Sidaway *v* Governors of the Bethlem Royal Hospital and the Maudsley Hospital and others (1985) 70 et seq, 77–8
Simaan General Contracting Co *v* Pilkington Glass Ltd (No 2) (1988) 116–17, 121, 124, 561

Smith *v* Eric S Bush; Harris *v* Wyre Forest District Council (1990) 118, 121, 122, 123, 127
SpA Salgoil *v* Italian Ministry of Foreign Trade (1968) (EC) 262–3, 469
Soc Civ Ste Marie de l'Assomption (1972) (Fr) 248
Stanlake Holdings Ltd *v* Tropical Capital Investment Ltd (1991) 352n, 359n
Stephens *v* G D Searle & Co (1985) (USA) 74–5
Stevenson, Jaques & Co *v* McLean (1880) 178
Stieller *v* Porirua City Council (1986) (NZ) 119
Stocken *v* Collin (1841) 172, 184
Summers *v* Tice (1948) (USA) 500 et seq
Terhune *v* A H Robbins (1978) (USA) 79
Toole *v* Richardson Merrell Inc (1967) (USA) 65–6
Townsend's Case (1871) 175, 187
Vacwell Engineering *v* BHD Chemicals (1971) 60
Van Duyn *v* Home Office (1974) (EC) 469–70, 474
Van Gend en Loos *v* Nederlandse Administratie der Belastingen (1963) (EC) 456 et seq
Vinolay (1978) (Fr) 249, 256
Von Colson and Komann *v* Land Nordrhein-Westfalen (1984) (EC) 478
Walford *v* Mines (1992) 586–9
Wall's Case (1872) 175–6, 187
Ward *v* Hopkins (1959) 60
Wards Cove Packing Company *v* Atonio (1989) (USA) 129 et seq
Welsh Development Agency *v* Export Finance Co (1992) 335–6
Wheeler *v* Leicester City Council (1985) 251, 256, 260
Williams *v* Giddy (1911) 256